



Committee and Date

Cabinet – March 20 2019

Item

Public

PROPOSED CLOSURE OF SHROPSHIRE COUNCIL BRING BANK SITES

Responsible Officer Mark Barrow

e-mail: mark.barrow@shropshire.gov.uk Tel: 01743 258919

1. Summary

- 1.1 Shropshire Council and Veolia currently provide bring banks at 120 sites across Shropshire. The council is proposing to remove the bring bank sites to generate a saving of £237,000 p.a.
- 1.2 As part of the Councils package of measures to establish a balanced budget for 2019/20 savings need to be made within the overall waste and recycling service area. This proposal supports this aim by making savings while minimising the impact on the overall service. There are established alternatives for householders in terms of kerbside recycling collections which offer environmental benefits over the bring bank system, and alternative charity and commercial bring bank services for textiles. Thus, this report only refers to Shropshire Council / Veolia bring banks.

2. Recommendations

- 2.1 **It is recommended that Cabinet approves the closure and removal of the Shropshire Council owned Bring Bank sites, and the budget for this service is removed.**

REPORT

3. Risk Assessment and Opportunities Appraisal

- 3.1 An Equality and Social inclusion Impact Assessment (ESIIA) has been undertaken and is attached in the appendix of this report. Screening indicates that there is a low impact in equality terms of removing the Bring Bank sites. The Assessment concludes that there could be a medium negative impact in the Social Inclusion category due to the potential reduction in availability of re-usable clothing and textiles. However, this outcome would assume that a high proportion of textiles are sent for disposal rather than diverted to other re-use collection methods which are

readily available. It should also be noted that commercial bring banks will still remain, as they are outside the scope of this report.

3.2 The key risks associated with this change are in the table below.

Risk	Response/Mitigation
Lower Recycling Rate	Main waste streams can be diverted to kerbside collection where quality control is higher, widespread availability of other banks and collections for textiles e.g. charity bags/"Cash for Clothes", Household Recycling Centres
Fly-tipping	Alternative routes available for materials and closure of sites will remove them as an opportunity/hotspot for leaving non-recyclable waste.
Reduced opportunities for recycling for residents with limited household storage	Review method of delivering kerbside recycling collections on case by case basis where there is a specific problem.

Opportunity	Description
Contribution to a balanced Council Budget	£237,000 p.a. after phased rollout in 2019/20
Increased availability of car parking spaces	42 sites are on Council car parks taking up space that will be released for parking.
Increased quality of recyclable material	Visible inspection of material as part of kerbside collections
Reduction in fly-tipping	Removal of sites as fly-tipping hotspots

4. Financial Implications

- 4.1 The provision of glass, paper and metal Bring Banks at 120 sites across Shropshire is currently serviced through the Council's waste collection and disposal contract with Veolia at a cost of £0.237m per annum. Closure and removal of these Shropshire Council owned Bring Bank sites would result in a comparable annual saving, which would contribute to the total saving of £1.500m identified in the 2019/20 Financial Strategy for Waste Services.
- 4.2 Implementation of the closure and removal of Shropshire Council owned Bring Bank sites could be achieved early in the 2019/20 financial year. The £0.237m full year saving is likely, therefore, to only be partially realised in 2019/20, e.g. if the implementation date is 1st June 2019 then the saving identified will be around £0.198m. The first-year saving will be further mitigated by the £0.007m one-off cost to remove the Bring Banks.

5. Background

- 5.1 There are currently 120 Bring Banks sites spread across the county as shown below. They are generally in public car parks, village halls, and pub car parks.

Materials

5.2 All of the sites have containers for glass, metal cans, and paper. Of these sites 57 also have textile recycling banks, 19 also have liquid carton recycling banks (e.g. tetrapack), and 17 have banks for small electrical equipment. The weight of material collected for each waste stream in the last five financial years is shown below.

Material Type	Tonnes Collected				
	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18
Paper	1,237	1,168	1,136	1,047	1,046
Glass	1,248	1,224	1,223	1,094	1,023
Metal Containers	140	95	80	73	70
Textiles	227	229	264	281	215
Liquid Cartons	17	26	24	25	26
Electrical Equipment	16	17	18	17	15
Total	2,885	2,759	2,745	2,537	2,395

5.3 The Electrical Equipment containers were supplied by a Producer Compliance Scheme (PCS) as an additional, free of charge, service related to a separate contract. This contract has recently been re-tendered and won by a different PCS who will not be providing Bring Banks.

The weight of material collected from each waste stream is shown below.

	Collected Tonnage 2017/18	% of total
Paper	1, 046	43.7%
Glass	1, 023	42.7%
Metal Containers	70	2.9%
Textiles	215	9.0%
Liquid Cartons	26	1.1%
Electrical Equipment	15	0.6%
Total	2, 395	100.0

5.4 Paper, glass, and metal containers are also collected for recycling as part of the kerbside collection service. These waste streams comprise 89.3% of the total collected tonnage from the Bring Sites. A further 9% of the total is textiles. Although the kerbside collection service does not include textiles, there are alternative options for this waste stream, particularly charity collection bags delivered to properties, charity shops and private bring banks on non-Council sites.

5.5 The Glass, Paper and Can banks are serviced by three Veolia vehicles covered by the contract. Each of the three vehicles has a driver and a loader. The savings of £237,000 p.a will be gained by removing vehicles and running costs from the contract charge and redeploying the drivers and loaders to take on work currently done by agency staff. The one-off cost of removing the banks is £7,000.

- 5.6 The textiles and liquid carton banks are not serviced by Veolia and there will be no savings resulting from the removal of these banks. However, if they remain in place the sites will still be a focus for fly-tipping with associated management costs in order to receive an even smaller quantity of material, less than 250 tonnes across the county.

	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18
Total Recycling Tonnage	39,886	38,246	38,812	40,280	41,169
Bring Banks Collected Tonnage	2,885	2,759	2,745	2,537	2,395
Tonnes collected from BB as % of Actual Recycling	7.2%	7.2%	7.1%	6.3%	5.8%

- 5.7 It is important to note the distinction between collected tonnage and actual recycling. The tonnage of waste collected from the Banks is not all suitable for recycling, as there is non-recyclable material, or contamination, mixed in with it. This non-recyclable material is weighed into the Transfer Station (TS) and included in the collected tonnage. TS staff then assess the material to decide whether it can be treated as recycling or whether it is so contaminated that it will be sent for disposal. We cannot state the exact tonnage that is sent for recycling, but discussions with TS staff indicate that there is a significant level of contaminated waste that is sent for disposal. Therefore, the actual contribution of the recycling banks to the total amount recycled is less than it appears.
- 5.8 The table above shows that as well as a reducing tonnage collected from the banks this also constitutes a diminishing proportion of total recycling, as the overall recycling tonnage has increased over the last 5 years.
- 5.9 As part of the Councils package of measures to establish a balanced budget for 2019/20 savings need to be made within the overall waste and recycling service are. In aiming to address this situation the focus has been on services where there is a practical alternative option or where there is no statutory obligation to provide a service. Removal of the Bring Banks service for household waste fits these requirements, as there is no statutory requirement to provide this service, c. 90% of the materials collected could also be picked up via our kerbside collection service, and we believe that a substantial proportion of the waste deposited in bring banks may be from businesses. As stated, commercial provision will still remain on other sites within Shropshire.

Other Issues

- 5.10 In addition to the available alternatives there are other issues which indicate the Bring Bank Sites do not provide Value for Money as part of the contract.

Fly-tipping

- 5.11 Despite all sites having clear signage to show the range of materials collected there is a significant amount of other waste left adjacent to the Bring Banks. This includes furniture, children's toys, and bags of mixed household waste. This is fly-tipping, although many of those responsible may not see it in that way and believe they are using a more generic waste site.

- 5.12 In general, this is a bigger problem in urban areas, but most sites experience it to some degree. If the dedicated Bring Bank service cannot remove the waste, it is picked up by vehicles diverted from regular household collections. In the worst cases this is three times per week, but more often the frequency is between weekly and monthly.
- 5.13 Although this is the most effective method of removing this waste it does mean that the exact number of cases or the tonnage of waste cannot be recorded separately. However, the Bring Bank crews have identified 32 sites with specific and regular problems. (Appendix 1).

Business Use

- 5.14 For similar reasons we have to rely on information from the collection crews with regard to business use of the sites. The crews estimate that at least 50% of the waste picked up is from trade sources, particularly bottles and cans from food and drink premises with paper and cardboard from various establishments. The sites are provided for household use but are abused by traders who should be dealing with their waste through formal contracts with licenced waste collection companies rather than relying on Council Tax payers to provide a service. Shropshire Council has no obligation to provide waste collection and disposal services free of charge to businesses and it is unlawful to dispose of commercial waste through the domestic waste stream.
- 5.15 The definition of trade use extends to waste generated from halls and clubs where a charge is made for room bookings.

Contamination

- 5.16 As mentioned previously the quality of material collected from these sites is low due to non-recyclable contaminants being deposited in the banks. Each bank is clearly labelled with the waste stream it is designed to accept, but other materials are frequently deposited into the banks including general mixed waste. A recent site survey happened to coincide with the visit of the vehicle used to empty the Liquid Carton bank. The bank was about one third full, with the contents including coat hangers, reading glasses, a beer keg and large portion of wedding cake. Further discussion with the contractor identified the site as being relatively good compared to some others.
- 5.17 There is a much more effective process for rejecting contamination on the kerbside service as crews can see it. Boxes and bags are not collected if there is contamination.

Environment

- 5.18 From an environmental point of view it is more efficient to collect recycling as part of the kerbside service than via Bring Banks. The Bring Bank vehicles cover the whole county with associated fuel use. The major waste streams will be diverted to existing household kerbside collections and to trade waste collection rounds.

5.19 It is also expected that there will be an increase in the household recycling tonnage. This is because there is better separation of waste at the kerbside and more waste will actually be passed for recycling compared to now, where a proportion is being rejected and sent for disposal. In addition, the trade element will be removed, much of which is also contamination where businesses are dumping waste in and around the banks. This will not appear in waste collected at the kerbside.

6. Consultation Feedback

6.1 Appendix x contains responses and analysis of the public consultation on removal of the Bring Bank service. A total of 270 formal responses were received and also 7 letters/emails from Town and Parish Councils.

Key concerns and mitigation are listed below.

6.2 Removal may increase fly-tipping.

The main material streams collected at the Bring Bank sites are also collected via the household kerbside recycling service. These waste streams are rarely fly-tipped. The main materials that are fly-tipped are construction waste and other forms of business waste. Business users of the sites will be expected to take out waste collection contracts with suitably qualified and licensed providers. This will be supported by spot checks requiring evidence of appropriate waste collection arrangements as required by the Duty of Care relating to waste from all premises.

6.3 Banks offer option to recycle waste not collected as part of the kerbside service.

There are several alternative recycling options for textiles as described in section 5 above. The Electrical Equipment banks are no longer in place as they were associated with a different contract. This leaves the Liquid Packaging banks. The remaining option for recycling this waste stream will be via the Household Recycling Centres. Only 26 tonnes was collected across the county in the last financial year, or 1.1% of the total Bring Bank tonnage.

6.4 Banks used by residents with limited household storage capacity.

If the removal of the sites causes a specific problem to a resident this will be addressed on a case by case basis to find a tailored solution to the issue.

6.5 Banks used by residents who do not have a kerbside recycling service

All households should be provided with a form of kerbside recycling collection service. If this is not currently being delivered this will be dealt with in the same manner as 6.4 above.

6.6 Banks used by residents who have difficulty moving full recycling boxes.

Such issues will also have to be addressed on a case by case basis and the solution may involve use of the "Assisted Collection" service.

6.7 Some Town and Parish Councils suggest sharing the cost of retaining certain bring sites in their area.

It may not be operationally possible to maintain an efficient service over a wide area with relatively low tonnage. An alternative option would be for these Councils to make their own arrangements with a private contractor which could then be tailored to waste streams and collection frequencies which suit that particular area.

7. Conclusions

- 7.1 Closure of the Bring Bank Sites in Shropshire will provide a full year saving of £237,000 p.a. While the risk of a reduction in material collected for recycling is acknowledged, there is effective mitigation of this risk in place, particularly as 90% of the materials collected at the sites are also collected by the kerbside service.
- 7.2 It is recommended that the Bring Bank sites are closed as part of the Councils package of measures to establish a balanced budget for 2019/20.

List of Background Papers (This MUST be completed for all reports, but does not include items containing exempt or confidential information)
None
Cabinet Member (Portfolio Holder)
Local Member N/A – countywide
Appendices Bring Bank Sites with fly-tipping issues EISSA Consultation Response Report Email comments on Bring Bank Site Closure